Aviation Safety Investigation Report 199403327

Beech Aircraft Corp Bonanza Piper Aircraft Corp Warrior

12 November 1994

Readers are advised that the Australian Transport Safety Bureau investigates for the sole purpose of enhancing transport safety. Consequently, Bureau reports are confined to matters of safety significance and may be misleading if used for any other purposes.

Investigations commenced on or before 30 June 2003, including the publication of reports as a result of those investigations, are authorised by the Executive Director of the Bureau in accordance with Part 2A of the Air Navigation Act 1920.

Investigations commenced after 1 July 2003, including the publication of reports as a result of those investigations, are authorised by the Executive Director of the Bureau in accordance with the Transport Safety Investigation Act 2003 (TSI Act). Reports released under the TSI Act are not admissible as evidence in any civil or criminal proceedings.

NOTE: All air safety occurrences reported to the ATSB are categorised and recorded. For a detailed explanation on Category definitions please refer to the ATSB website at www.atsb.gov.au.

The Bureau did not conduct an on scene investigation of this occurrence. The information presented below was obtained from information supplied to the Bureau.

<b>Occurrence Number:</b>	199403327	Occurrence Type:	Incident		
Location:	18km SE Melbourne				
State:	VIC	Inv Category:	4		
Date:	Saturday 12 November 1994				
Time:	1350 hours	Time Zone	ESuT		
Highest Injury Level: None					
Aircraft Manufacturer: Piper Aircraft Corp					
Aircraft Model:	PA-28-161				
Aircraft Registration:	VH-AGS	AGS Serial Number: 28-7716274			
Type of Operation:	Non-commercial Pleasure	/Travel			
Damage to Aircraft:	Nil				
<b>Departure Point:</b>	Moorabbin VIC				
<b>Departure Time:</b>					
Destination:	Moorabbin VIC				

**Crew Details:** 

		Hours on	
	Role	<b>Class of Licence</b>	<b>Type Hours Total</b>
	Pilot-In-Command	Private	90.0 90
Aircraft Manufacturer:	Beech Aircraft Corp		
Aircraft Model:	A36		
Aircraft Registration:	VH-AWL	Serial Numb	er: E-1851
<b>Type of Operation:</b>	Non-commercial Un	nknown	
Damage to Aircraft:	Nil		
<b>Departure Point:</b>			
<b>Departure Time:</b>			
Destination:			

Approved for Release: Wednesday, November 23, 1994

VH-AWL was operating over the central business district (CBD) at 2000 feet when VH-AGS called Essendon tower at Point Ormond (PTO) requesting clearance also to operate over the CBD at 2000 feet. Due to workload the clearance was denied and VH-AGS was asked to sight VH-AWL. Later, a radar return was observed entering the control zone north of Point Ormond flying at the same level and in the opposite direction to VH-AWL. The pilot of VH-AGS was asked to sight VH-AWL which he did at a range of about one mile. There was insufficient time to alert VH-AWL. VH-AGS was about 1.5 miles inside the control zone at the time of the confliction.

The pilot of VH-AGS later claimed that he thought he was cleared to enter the control zone once he had sighted the other aircraft. He also thought he had been told the other aircraft was at 3000 feet. He had the other aircraft in sight from the time he entered the control zone until the confliction occurred. He estimated the two aircraft passed with 200 feet of vertical separation and about 200 metres of lateral separation.