

**Aviation Safety Investigation Report  
199600816**

**Agusta, SPA, Costruzioni Aeronautiche  
Power  
Piper Aircraft Corp  
Twin Comanchee**

**18 February 1996**

Readers are advised that the Australian Transport Safety Bureau investigates for the sole purpose of enhancing transport safety. Consequently, Bureau reports are confined to matters of safety significance and may be misleading if used for any other purposes.

Investigations commenced on or before 30 June 2003, including the publication of reports as a result of those investigations, are authorised by the Executive Director of the Bureau in accordance with Part 2A of the Air Navigation Act 1920.

Investigations commenced after 1 July 2003, including the publication of reports as a result of those investigations, are authorised by the Executive Director of the Bureau in accordance with the Transport Safety Investigation Act 2003 (TSI Act). Reports released under the TSI Act are not admissible as evidence in any civil or criminal proceedings.

**NOTE: All air safety occurrences reported to the ATSB are categorised and recorded. For a detailed explanation on Category definitions please refer to the ATSB website at [www.atsb.gov.au](http://www.atsb.gov.au).**

The Bureau did not conduct an on scene investigation of this occurrence. The information presented below was obtained from information supplied to the Bureau.

**Occurrence Number:** 199600816                      **Occurrence Type:** Incident  
**Location:** World Trade Centre, (ALA)  
**State:** VIC    **Inv Category:** 4  
**Date:** Sunday 18 February 1996  
**Time:** 1145 hours                                      **Time Zone**                      ESuT  
**Highest Injury Level:** None

**Aircraft Manufacturer:** Piper Aircraft Corp  
**Aircraft Model:** PA-39  
**Aircraft Registration:** VH-TPS                                      **Serial Number:** 39-78  
**Type of Operation:** Non-commercial Pleasure/Travel  
**Damage to Aircraft:** Nil  
**Departure Point:** Hamilton Vic  
**Departure Time:**  
**Destination:** Essendon Vic

**Aircraft Manufacturer:** Agusta, SPA, Costruzioni Aeronautiche  
**Aircraft Model:** A109A II  
**Aircraft Registration:** VH-TMA                                      **Serial Number:** 7288  
**Type of Operation:** Non-commercial Corporate/Executive  
**Damage to Aircraft:** Nil  
**Departure Point:** World Trade Centre VIC  
**Departure Time:**  
**Destination:** Essendon Vic

**Approved for Release:** Wednesday, May 22, 1996

A breakdown in separation occurred between two VFR aircraft, a twin Comanche cleared Station Pier for Essendon at 1,500 ft and a helicopter cleared World Trade Centre for Essendon on climb to not above 1,500 ft. Essendon Tower passed traffic to each aircraft but the helicopter pilot claimed not to have heard advice on the Comanche.

The Comanche pilot never saw the helicopter whereas the helicopter pilot saw the Comanche pass about 200 ft overhead.

#### Significant Factors

The following factors were considered relevant to the development of the incident:

1. Both aircraft were cleared at the same altitude.

2. The two pilots did not take adequate action to ensure separation was maintained.
3. Air traffic control did not provide sufficient information to the two pilots to assist them to sight each other's aircraft.

