

**Aviation Safety Investigation Report
199102620**

**Piper PA31 Navajo
Embraer EMB110-P2 Bandierante**

4 February 1991

Readers are advised that the Australian Transport Safety Bureau investigates for the sole purpose of enhancing transport safety. Consequently, Bureau reports are confined to matters of safety significance and may be misleading if used for any other purposes.

Investigations commenced on or before 30 June 2003, including the publication of reports as a result of those investigations, are authorised by the CEO of the Bureau in accordance with Part 2A of the Air Navigation Act 1920.

Investigations commenced after 1 July 2003, including the publication of reports as a result of those investigations, are authorised by the CEO of the Bureau in accordance with the Transport Safety Investigation Act 2003 (TSI Act). Reports released under the TSI Act are not admissible as evidence in any civil or criminal proceedings.

NOTE: All air safety occurrences reported to the ATSB are categorised and recorded. For a detailed explanation on Category definitions please refer to the ATSB website at www.atsb.gov.au.

Occurrence Number: 199102620
Location: 50 km South of Ballidu WA
Date: 4 February 1991
Highest Injury Level: Nil
Injuries:

Occurrence Type: Incident
Time: 856

	Fatal	Serious	Minor	None
Crew	0	0	0	0
Ground	0	0	0	-
Passenger	0	0	0	0
Total	0	0	0	0

Aircraft Details:	Piper PA31 Navajo	Embraer EMB110-P2
		Bandierante
Registration:	VH-ITF	VH-MWX
Serial Number:	31-7812014	110-190
Operation Type:	Charter	Charter
Damage Level:	Nil	Nil
Departure Point:	Reedys Gold Mine WA	Reedys Gold Mine WA
Departure Time:	0732	740
Destination:	Perth WA	

Approved for Release: 6th June 1991

Circumstances:

The two aircraft were on identical tracks, with the slower aircraft (VH-ITF) in front and maintaining 8000 feet. VH-MWX was faster and maintaining 10000 feet. Due to military flying activity they were unable to fly from Ballidu direct to Perth, but obtained a clearance to track via Clackline. VH-ITF obtained a clearance to enter controlled airspace (65 nautical miles from Perth) at 6000 feet, while VH-MWX was cleared to enter at 5000 feet. Although both aircraft had reported at Ballidu at the same time, the pilots were unable to see the other aircraft. VH-ITF descended to 6000 feet and the pilot of VH-MWX elected to descend to 7000 feet until he could maintain visual contact with the other aircraft. If he had not seen the other aircraft before entering controlled airspace (CTA) he intended orbiting outside CTA until separation was obtained. The pilot of VH-MWX saw the other aircraft about 13 kilometres before the airspace boundary and commenced descent to 5000 feet. He was overtaking to the left of the other aircraft and at the same altitude when VH-ITF was instructed to make a left orbit by the controller. This action was halted when the pilot of VH-MWX advised the other pilot and the controller against the turn because his own aircraft was in the way. VH-MWX subsequently descended to 5000 feet and VH-ITF was instructed to orbit to gain lateral spacing with the other aircraft. Identification of VH-MWX on radar was completed at 57 nautical miles (103 kilometres) from Perth, after the pilot had reported at 5000 feet.

Significant Factors:

The following factor was considered relevant to the development of the incident

1. The controller used a poor technique in allocating clearances. This incident was not the subject of an on-scene investigation.